ORIGINAL ARTICLE

David M. Parichy · Stephen L. Johnson

Zebrafish hybrids suggest genetic mechanisms for pigment pattern diversification in *Danio*

Received: 18 December 2000 / Accepted: 27 February 2001 / Published online: 5 May 2001 © Springer-Verlag 2001

Abstract Pigment patterns of *Danio* fishes are a tractable system for assessing the developmental genetic bases for the evolution of adult form in vertebrates. These pigment patterns include multiple horizontal melanophore stripes in the zebrafish D. rerio, a complete absence of stripes in D. albolineatus, a few broad stripes in D. kerri, and a combination of stripes and spots in *D. nigrofasciatus*. Here we assess the genetics of pigment pattern development and evolution using interspecific hybrids. We first reconstruct the phylogenetic relationships of these species by analyzing mitochondrial 12S and 16S rDNA sequences. We find a clade comprising several small species of danio, and within this clade a sister taxon relationship between D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus. We also find that the large bodied *D. dangila* is more closely related to the clade of small danios than other large bodied species. As a first step in evaluating the genetics of pigment pattern diversification in the group, we then examine the phenotypes of interspecific hybrids. Adult pigment patterns of hybrids between D. rerio and other danios are in many respects more similar to D. rerio than the heterospecific danio, demonstrating that alleles of pigment pattern genes in other species typically are recessive to D. rerio alleles. Furthermore, hybrids between two additional striped species (D. kerri, D. nigrofasciatus) and D. albolineatus suggest that striped patterns are dominant or semi-dominant over an absence of stripes. Together, these analyses support a model in which pigment pattern differences between D. rerio and other

Edited by D.A. Weisblat

D.M. Parichy (⊠) · S.L. Johnson Department of Genetics, Washington University Medical School, St. Louis, MO 63110, USA e-mail: dparichy@mail.utexas.edu Tel.: +1-512-2329143, Fax: +1-512-4713878

D.M. Parichy Section of Integrative Biology and Section of Molecular, Cell and Developmental Biology, Institute for Cellular and Molecular Biology, University of Texas, Austin, TX 78712, USA

species result from gain-of-function alleles in D. rerio, or loss-of-function alleles in other danios. Finally, because several D. rerio pigment pattern mutants resemble heterospecific danios, we use interspecific complementation tests to assess potential roles for these loci in pigment pattern diversification. Crosses between other danios and most D. rerio pigment pattern mutants develop stripes, similar to control hybrids with wild-type D. rerio. These complementation phenotypes allow us to exclude most of these loci as having major effect roles in generating pigment pattern differences between species. In contrast, hybrids between fms mutant D. rerio and D. albolineatus fail to develop stripes, similar to D. albolineatus. This non-complementation phenotype identifies changes in *fms*, or the pathway in which it acts, as candidates for contributing to the evolutionary loss of stripes in *D. albolineatus*.

Keywords Evolution · Neural crest · Phylogenetic systematics · Pattern formation · Melanophore

Introduction

The genes and cellular behaviors underlying differences in adult form remain largely unknown, particularly among vertebrates. Yet, a knowledge of the mechanistic bases for phenotypic variation will be essential for a more complete understanding of the evolution of morphology. One approach to addressing this problem is to search for genetic and developmental differences that underlie differences in the expression of a trait between closely related species, as mechanistic differences observed at shallow phylogenetic levels are more likely to be causally related to trait variation than mechanistic differences that may have accumulated between species at deeper phylogenetic levels. Adult pigment patterns of fishes in the genus *Danio* are particularly amenable to genetic and developmental analyses because these patterns differ dramatically across closely related species,

because pigment patterns are accessible to observation and experimentation, and because one species, the zebrafish *D. rerio*, is a commonly used model organism with a variety of resources that can be applied towards understanding the evolution of developmental genetic mechanisms (Meyer et al. 1995; Parichy 1996; Fang 1997a, 1998; McClure 1999).

In danios and other ectothermic vertebrates, several classes of pigment cells are derived from embryonic neural crest cells, including black melanophores, yellow or orange xanthophores, silvery iridophores, and red erythrophores (Fujii 1993; Bagnara 1998; Reedy et al. 1998). Pigment patterns result from the numbers and spatial arrangements of these differently colored pigment cells, and these patterns may have roles in mate choice, camouflage, and schooling behavior (e.g. Endler 1978;



Fig. 1 Adult *Danio rerio* exhibit several well-defined, horizontal dark stripes with intervening, light interstripe regions. Primary melanophore stripes (1) are the first stripes to develop and arise during metamorphosis. Secondary melanophore stripes (2) arise during later juvenile and adult stages as the fish grow. *Arrows* indicate locations used for determining melanophore and stripe numbers (see text)

Houde 1997). Examples of *Danio* pigment patterns are shown in Figs. 1-3. D. rerio exhibit four to five horizontal dark stripes that include melanophores and iridophores, with light interstripe regions that include xanthophores and iridophores (Fig. 1). In contrast, D. albolineatus lack stripes and instead exhibit a dispersed pattern of melanophores, and xanthophores or erythrophores (Fig. 2A); D. kerri have three broad stripes of melanophores that are defined by light interstripe regions (Fig. 2B); and D. nigrofasciatus exhibit melanophore stripes dorsally and melanophore spots ventrally (Fig. 2C). Finally, in addition to the small bodied species (3-5 cm total length) shown in Figs. 1 and 2, the genus also includes large bodied species (12-15 cm total length) such as D. aequipinnatus and D. dangila. The former exhibits three broad horizontal melanophore stripes posteriorly defined by light interstripe regions, as well as light vertical stripes, spots, or horizontal stripes anteriorly (Fig. 3A); D. dangila exhibits a pattern of wavy light stripes and spots (Fig. 3B; also see Fang 1997a, b).

Although little is known of pigment pattern formation in most danios, the development of the adult pigment pattern in *D. rerio* is becoming increasingly well understood (Kirschbaum 1975; Milos and Dingle 1978; Johnson et al. 1995; McClure 1999; Parichy et al. 2000a, b). In this species, pigment pattern metamorphosis transforms an early larval pigment pattern comprising stripes of melanophores along the dorsal and ventral myotomes and yolk mass into the horizontal striped pattern of the adult. During an initial phase, a population of early metamorphic (EM) melanophores arises dispersed over



Fig. 2 Examples of small danios (A–C) and *D. rerio* pigment pattern mutants (D–F). A *D. albolineatus* exhibit a dispersed arrangement of melanophores on the body and thus lack stripes. In addition to iridophores this species also exhibits widely dispersed xanthophores and reddish cells that may be erythrophores (Bagnara 1998; McClure 1999). B *D. kerri* exhibit three broad melanophore stripes that are defined by lighter, narrow interstripe regions. C *D. nigrofasciatus* exhibits melanophore stripes dorsally and a series of melanophore spots ventrally. D *fms* mutant *D. rerio* lack distinc-

tive stripes, owing to a defect in melanophore and xanthophore development (Parichy et al. 2000b). Shown is *fins*^{*i*4e1}; pigment patterns of other *fins* alleles are indistinguishable. **E** *jaguar* mutant *D*. *rerio* have fewer and broader stripes than wild-type *D*. *rerio*. Shown is *jaguar*^{c5}. **F** *ednrb1* (*rose*) mutant *D*. *rerio* exhibit melanophore stripes dorsally and spots ventrally. Shown is the weak allele *ednrb1*^{*i*3e3}; more severe (*ednrb1*^{*b*140}) or null alleles (*ednrb1*^{*i*3e1}) typically exhibit only a single melanophore stripe dorsally, and spots ventrally.

 Table 1
 Zebrafish pigment pattern mutants identify candidate
genes for contributing to interspecific pigment pattern variation. Mutants and corresponding references are indicated, as well as the overall mutant phenotype and, when known, adult pigment cell populations known to be deficient in mutant individuals (EM early metamorphic melanophores, LM late metamorphic melanophores, SM scale melanophores, irid. iridophore, xanth. xanthophore). Species indicated are those tested for non-complementation with the candidate mutant (al, D. albolineatus, ke, D. kerri, ni, D. nigrofasciatus)

Mutant	Phenotype	Species
ednrb 1 (rose) ^{a,b}	Melanophore stripes dorsally, spots ventrally (LM, irid.)	al, ni
fms (panther) ^c fritz ^d	Disrupted stripes anteriorly; stripes absent posteriorly (LM, xanth.) Disrupted stripes or spots	al, ke, ni al, ni
jaguar ^{e,t} kit (sparse) ^{b,c,g,h}	Fewer and broader melanophore stripes Reduced melanophore number and fewer melanophore stripes (EM, SM)	al, ke, ni al, ke, ni
<i>leopard</i> ^{b,i–k} <i>nacre (mitf)</i> ¹	Melanophore spots; nearly uniformly distributed melanophores in strong alleles (LM) Melanophores absent (EM, LM, SM)	al, ni al, ni
ocelot ^e	Broken melanophore stripes Melanophore stripes dorrally spots ventrally (I M irid)	al al ni
puma ^d	disrupted stripes	al ni
^a Parichy et al. 2000a	g Parichy et al. 1999	

h Rawls and Johnson 2000

ⁱ Asai et al. 1999 ^j Haffter et al. 1996

k Kirschbaum 1975

¹Lister et al. 1999

Parichy et al. 2000a

^b Johnson et al. 1995

^c Parichy et al. 2000b

^d Parichy, unpubl. data

e Johnson, unpubl. data

^f Johnson et al. 1996



Fig. 3A, B Examples of large danios. A D. aequipinnatus exhibit three broad melanophore stripes posteriorly, and light spots or stripes anteriorly. B D. dangila exhibit wavy stripes and light spots

the flank in regions not previously occupied by these cells. Subsequently, EM melanophores migrate into the positions of adult stripes and, simultaneously, a second population of late metamorphic (LM) melanophores differentiates in the positions of these adult stripes. These events result in the formation of a juvenile/early adult pigment pattern by around 28 days that comprises two stripes of melanophores (here referred to as "primary" melanophore stripes) and a lighter interstripe region. During later development, additional stripes ("secondary" melanophore stripes) form as the fish grow (Fig. 1).

Analyses of pigment pattern mutants in D. rerio also have started to reveal the genetic bases for adult stripe development. Several loci have been identified for which mutants lack one or another population of pigment cells comprising the adult pigment pattern (Table 1). For example, kit (formerly sparse) mutant D. rerio fail to develop EM melanophores, as well as dermal scale melanophores that normally contribute an overall dark cast to the dorsum of the fish (Johnson et al. 1995; Parichy et al. 1999). In contrast, fms mutants lack both LM melanophores and xanthophores (Fig. 2D; Parichy et al. 2000b), whereas endothelin receptor b1 (ednrb1, formerly rose; Fig. 2F; Johnson et al. 1995; Parichy et al. 2000a) and primrose (S.L. Johnson, unpublished data) mutant D. rerio fail to develop LM melanophores and iridophores.

Intriguingly, the pigment patterns of several D. rerio mutants resemble the naturally occurring pigment patterns of other danios. For example, *fms* and *leopard* mutants lack stripes due to varying degrees of melanophore dispersion, similar to D. albolineatus (Fig. 2A, D); *jaguar* mutants have fewer and broader stripes, similar to D. kerri (Fig. 2B, E); and ednrb1 and primrose mutants exhibit stripes dorsally and spots ventrally, similar to D. nigrofasciatus (Fig. 2C, F). These observations raise the possibility that the same genes or cell populations affected in zebrafish pigment pattern mutants also might contribute to pigment pattern differences between D. rerio and other danios. Moreover, even loci for which D. rerio mutants do not closely resemble other danios represent a priori candidates for contributing to interspecific pigment pattern differences, as differences in genetic background and allelic strength may result in different phenotypes across species. As a single example, nacre/microphthalmia mutant D. rerio lack stripes due to a complete absence of melanophores (Lister et al. 1999); a weak allele in another species might only reduce melanophore numbers and in so doing change the pattern of these cells, as compared to D. rerio.

In this study, we use interspecific hybrids to evaluate the genetic bases for pigment pattern variation among danios. We first reconstruct phylogenetic relationships for the taxa used in this analysis, and assess these relationships in light of hybrid viability and fertility. We then show that hybrids between several species and *D. rerio* exhibit pigment patterns similar to that of *D. rerio*, consistent with a model in which pigment pattern differences result from gain-of-function alleles in *D. rerio* relative to other species (or loss-of-function alleles in other species relative to *D. rerio*). Finally, we test interspecific roles for pigment pattern genes identified as *D. rerio* mutants by crossing these mutants to heterospecific danios; these analyses exclude most of these loci from having major effect roles in promoting species differences, but identify one locus, *fms*, as a potential contributor to the loss of stripes in *D. albolineatus*. These studies thus represent an initial step in elucidating the developmental genetics of pigment pattern variation in *Danio*.

Materials and methods

Fish stocks and genetic crossing

Wild-type D. rerio used in these analyses were strain AB or its derivative, C32 (Streisinger et al. 1981; Nechiporuk et al. 1999). D. rerio pigment pattern mutants were maintained in these backgrounds, with the exception of *fms^{i4blue}* which is derived from the pet trade and maintained in its original genetic background for the purpose of identifying modifiers of *fms* activity (see below). D. albolineatus and D. kerri were provided by M. McClure (McClure 1999), D. nigrofasciatus were derived from stocks collected in Myunmar and provided by K. Yap, and D. dangila were provided by D. Nopany. M. Halpern and S. Fisher provided *jaguar*^{c5} and deficiency *jaguar*^{c7}/+ *D. rerio* (Fisher et al. 1997) and J. Lister and D. Raible provided nacre w2 D. rerio. All mutant alleles tested for non-complementation in interspecific hybrids were recessive, with the exceptions of jaguar^{c5} and jaguar^{b230}, which are semi-dominant in *D. rerio* (see Results). All fertilizations were performed in vitro according to standard procedures (Westerfield 1993). Typically 10-50 hybrids representing 4-10 families were examined for each species and allelic combination, though strain availability and differential survivorship across species precluded examination of such large numbers for some hybrid combinations. For example, mutant D. rerio \times D. kerri hybrids in some families were weak and failed to reach maturity. Nevertheless, at least 5 individuals representing at least 2 families were examined for all hybrid combinations reported here. When possible, crosses were performed with both male and female D. rerio, though hybrid phenotypes were not seen to differ depending on sex of parents. Hybrid pigment patterns were evaluated upon reaching adult stages, 2–3 months following fertilization.

Phylogenetic analysis and sequencing

To assess phylogenetic relationships among danios used in this study we isolated DNA by standard methods from two individuals each of D. dangila, D. nigrofasciatus, D. albolineatus, D. cf. aequipinnatus, and Rasbora trilineata. We then used universal primers to amplify segments of mitochondrial 12S rDNA (H1478, 5'-TGACTGCAGAGGGTGACGGGCGGTGTGT-3' L1091, 5'-AAAAAGCTTCAAACTGGGATTAGATACCCCACTAT-3'; Kocher et al. 1989) and mitochondrial 16S rDNA (16Sar-L, 5'-CGCCTGTTTATCAAAAACAT-3'; 16Sbr-H, 5'-CCGGTCTG AACTCAGATCACGT-3'; Palumbi et al. 1991). Sequences were aligned using CLUSTAL-W, inspected by eye and edited as necessary, then analyzed with PAUP 4.0b4a for Macintosh (Swofford 2000). Maximum likelihood analyses employed a general time reversible model for character state transformations with rate matrix estimation and among site variation modeled with a gamma distribution estimated from the data. Trees reconstructed using parsimony were evaluated by bootstrapping with 1,000 replicates. To examine the primary structure of the *fins* gene (see below), we amplified overlapping fragments of the *fins* open reading frame from oligo-dT-primed cDNAs produced from at least two individuals each of *D. rerio*, *D. nigrofasciatus*, *D. albolineatus*, *D. kerri*, and *D. dangila* (primer sequences available on request; GenBank accession numbers: AF240639, AF324481, AF324478, AF324480, AF324479). All sequencing was performed using BigDye dye terminator chemistry on an ABI377 automated sequencer.

Quantitative methods

To evaluate quantitative differences in pigment patterns between D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus we assessed melanophore numbers and positions along each of three dorsoventral "transects" on the flank: at the anterior margin of the pelvic fins, and at the anterior and posterior margins of the anal fin (Fig. 1). We assessed the number of stripes according to the mean number of discrete regions of high melanophore density that occurred along each of these transects. Thus, spots that might be present along one transect but not another are represented as fractions <1. Additionally, we determined the number of melanophores within each stripe or spot and used these values to calculate the total numbers of melanophores comprising early developing "primary" melanophore stripes versus later developing "secondary" melanophore stripes. We measured the size of fish by the dorsoventral height of the flank at each transect position, and by the distance from the anterior of the jaw to the caudal peduncle. All fish were similarly sized when evaluated, and because preliminary analyses using these measures of size as covariates did not reveal significant effects on patterning, they are not included in analyses presented below. Statistical analyses were performed using JMP for Apple Macintosh (SAS Institute, Cary, N.C.).

Results

Phylogenetic relationships and pigment pattern evolution within *Danio*

As an initial step in assessing the genetic bases for pigment pattern evolution in *Danio*, we evaluated the phylogenetic placement of D. nigrofasciatus and D. dangila, as these taxa have not been included in previous phylogenetic reconstructions. Sequencing segments of mitochondrial 12S and 16S rDNA and analyses of sequences from GenBank yielded a total of 780 alignable nucleotides (nt) of which 162 nt were phylogenetically informative (12S, 52 nt; 16S, 110 nt). Preliminary analyses using maximum parsimony suggested only marginal discordance between data sets for reconstructed phylogenetic relationships (partition homogeneity test, 1,000 replicates: P=0.10; Fig. 4A, B). In analyses combining 12S and 16S data sets, equivalent phylogenetic reconstructions were obtained by maximum likelihood, maximum parsimony (Fig. 4C), and distance methods (Fig. 4D). These analyses all revealed a clade consisting of D. albolineatus, D. pulcher, and D. kerri, and a separate less strongly supported clade comprising D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus. Although an earlier phylogenetic analysis identified separate clades of small danios (e.g. D. rerio, D. kerri) and large danios (e.g. D. pathirana, D. cf. aequipinnatus; Meyer et al.

Fig. 4A–D Phylogenetic relationships of danios. A. B Maximum parsimony 50% majority rule consensus trees based on 12S rDNA (A) and 16S rDNA (**B**) sequences. **C** Maximum parsimony tree derived from combining 12S and 16S rDNA datasets. Numbers above branches indicate percentage bootstrap support. D Neighborjoining tree of combined 12S and 16S rDNA data sets. R Rasbora, P Pseudorasbora. GenBank accession numbers for 12S and 16S rDNA sequences for each taxon are (top to bottom): AF322656, AF322661; NC002333, NC002333; AF322657, AF322662; AF322658, AF322663; U21373, U21382; Ú21372, U21381; AF322659, AF322664; U21376, U21384; U21375, U21370; U21377, U21385; AF322660. AF322665; U21553, U21554; U21378, U21386



1995), our analyses indicate that the large bodied *D. dangila* is more closely related to the clade of small danios than other large bodied species. An analysis of character evolution using the hypothesis of phylogenetic relationships in Fig. 4C, D suggests most parsimoniously that a pattern including at least some horizontal stripes is ancestral for the clade including *D. rerio*, *D. nigrofasciatus*, *D. albolineatus*, and *D. kerri*. The increased number of stripes in *D. rerio*, the reduction in stripe number and presence of ventral spots in *D. nigrofasciatus*, are all evolutionarily derived.

Hybrid phenotypes in Danio

As a first step in evaluating the genetic bases for stripe evolution and loss, we assessed patterns of dominance and recessivity in hybrids between D. rerio and other danios. Interspecific hybrids also provided an independent test of phylogenetic relationships among danios. These analyses revealed that hybrids between D. rerio and either D. cf. aequipinnatus or the minnow Tanichthys albonubes were not viable past 3 days (data not shown) consistent with a relatively large phylogenetic distance separating these taxa (also see Meyer et al. 1995). In contrast, hybrids between D. dangila and D. rerio were vigorous through adult stages, and reached sizes intermediate to the two parental species (D.M. Parichy, unpublished data). Crosses between D. rerio and either D. albolineatus, D. kerri, or D. nigrofasciatus also produced viable adult hybrids. Finally, only crosses between D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus produced fertile hybrids, though backcross progeny often were not viable, likely due to chromosomal rearrangements between parental species (D.M. Parichy, unpublished data). Thus, the pattern of hybrid viability and fertility is concordant with phylogenetic relationships inferred by rDNA sequence analysis.

Pigment patterns of adult hybrids between *D. rerio* and *D. dangila*, *D. albolineatus*, and *D. kerri* typically resembled *D. rerio* more closely than the heterospecific parent. *D. rerio* \times *D. dangila* hybrids lacked the wavy stripes and spots present in *D. dangila*, and instead exhibited regular horizontal stripes (Fig. 5A). Likewise, *D. rerio* \times *D. albolineatus* hybrids exhibited melanophore stripes rather than a uniform pattern (Fig. 5B), though these stripes tended to have somewhat irregular borders as compared to *D. rerio*. Finally, *D. rerio* \times *D. kerri* hybrids typically exhibited four to five melanophore stripes (Fig. 5C), as in *D. rerio*, rather than three melanophore stripes as in *D. kerri*. Thus, alleles of pigment pattern genes in *D. dangila*, *D. albolineatus*, and *D. kerri* typically are recessive to *D. rerio* alleles.

Hybrids between D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus developed pigment patterns that included characteristics of each parental species (Fig. 5D). To evaluate these pigment patterns more thoroughly, we counted the numbers of stripes, and numbers of melanophores within stripes, in D. rerio, D. nigrofasciatus, and the hybrids between these species. Mean numbers of melanophore stripes differed significantly among parental species and hybrids, with hybrids exhibiting on average a stripe number marginally closer to D. nigrofasciatus than D. rerio (Fig. 7A). Additionally, we compared the numbers of melanophores present in juvenile/early adult primary melanophore stripes, and later adult secondary melanophore stripes. Melanophores were more numerous within primary melanophore stripes of D. rerio than D. nigrofasciatus, and numbers of primary stripe melanophores in D. rerio \times D. nigrofasciatus hybrids did not differ significantly from D. rerio, but were significantly greater



Fig. 5A-F Hybrids reveal patterns of dominance and recessivity among danio pigment patterns. A D. rerio \times D. dangila hybrids exhibit multiple distinctive horizontal stripes (compare to Figs. 1, 3B). **B** D. rerio \times D. albolineatus hybrids develop horizontal melanophore stripes (Figs. 1, 2A). C D. rerio \times D. kerri hybrids exhibit an increased number of melanophore stripes and these stripes are more clearly defined as compared to D. kerri (Figs. 1, 2B). **D** D. rerio \times D. nigrofasciatus hybrids exhibit intermediate pigment patterns as compared to parental species, with an increased number of stripes, as well as numbers of melanophores in primary and secondary melanophore stripes as compared to D. nigrofasciatus (Figs. 1, 2C). Shown is a fixed specimen. **E** D. albolineatus \times D. nigrofasciatus hybrids develop melanophore stripes that are most distinctive posteriorly (Fig. 2A, C). alb, D. albolineatus. **F** D. albolineatus \times D. kerri hybrids exhibit melanophore stripes, though these stripes typically are somewhat less distinctive than those exhibited by D. kerri (Fig. 2A, B)

than in *D. nigrofasciatus* (Fig. 7B). Melanophores comprising secondary stripes also were more numerous in *D. rerio* than *D. nigrofasciatus*. In contrast to primary stripe melanophores, however, numbers of secondary stripe more similar to *D. nigrofasciatus* hybrids were more similar to *D. nigrofasciatus* than *D. rerio* (Fig. 7C). Thus, alleles of genes controlling primary stripe melanophore number in *D. nigrofasciatus* appear to be largely recessive to *D. rerio* alleles, whereas alleles of genes controlling the numbers of stripes, and melanophores within secondary stripes, are co-dominant between species.

Hybrids between *D. rerio* and other species suggest that a pattern of stripes is dominant over a pattern lacking stripes. To further test the generality of this result, we also crossed *D. albolineatus* to *D. nigrofasciatus* and to *D. kerri*. These hybrids were viable but infertile. Hybrids between *D. albolineatus* and *D. nigrofasciatus* exhibited a pattern intermediate between parental species: stripes formed posteriorly, but were increasingly diffuse anteriorly (Fig. 5E). Hybrids between *D. albolineatus* and *D. kerri* also developed intermediate patterns, exhibiting stripes that were less distinctive than those of *D. kerri* (Fig. 5F). Together, phenotypes expressed by hybrids indicate that a pattern of stripes is dominant or semi-dominant over the *D. albolineatus* pattern, which lacks stripes.

Analysis of candidate genes for heterospecific pigment patterns

Our finding that alleles of pigment pattern genes in other species frequently are recessive to D. rerio alleles suggests that genetic complementation tests could be used to ask whether genes isolated as pigment pattern mutants in D. rerio might be the same genes that contribute to interspecific pigment pattern differences. In standard genetics, the complementation test is used to determine whether two mutations affect different genes or the same gene. If a cross between two mutants yields phenotypically wild-type offspring, the mutations are said to complement and are inferred to affect different genes. If the cross yields phenotypically mutant offspring, the mutations are said to non-complement and are inferred to affect the same gene. In an interspecific context, complementation tests have been used to ask whether mutants in a tester species correspond to the same affected genes in another, closely related species (Long et al. 1996; Sucena and Stern 2000). With respect to danio pigment patterns, crosses between D. rerio mutant for pigment pattern genes and heterospecific danios should thus provide an efficient means to rapidly exclude or include candidate genes for future analysis: hybrids that resemble control hybrids between wild-type D. rerio and the heterospecific danio (i.e. exhibit a complementation phenotype) would suggest there is no difference in the activity of the candidate gene between species; hybrids that resemble the mutant D. rerio or heterospecific parent (i.e. exhibit a non-complementation phenotype) suggest there may be an interspecific difference in the activity of the candidate gene. Such a difference might reflect an evolutionary change in the primary structure of the gene that affects its function, or changes in its spatial and temporal regulation. To test potential roles for these previously isolated pigment pattern genes, we crossed D. rerio pigment pattern mutants (Table 1) to D. albolineatus, D. kerri, and D. nigrofasciatus, and compared the phenotypes of the resulting hybrids to control hybrids between wild-type *D. rerio* and each of these species (shown in Fig. 5B–D).



Fig. 6A–F Hybrids between *D. rerio* pigment pattern mutants and other danios suggest and exclude candidate genes and mechanisms for pigment pattern diversification. **A** *D. albolineatus* × fms^{j4e1} mutant *D. rerio* lack stripes and exhibit a pigment pattern more similar to *D. albolineatus* (Fig. 2A) than control hybrids (Fig. 5B). *alb D. albolineatus*. **B** *D. albolineatus* × *jaguar*^{c5} mutant *D. rerio* also lack stripes (see text). **C** *D. albolineatus* × *nacre* ^{w2}/*mitf* mutant *D. rerio* develop stripes similar to control hybrids. **D** *D. albolineatus* × *leopard*^{t1} mutant *D. rerio* also develop stripes. **E** *D. kerri* × *jaguar*^{b230} mutant *D. rerio* exhibit fewer stripes that are more similar to *D. kerri* (Fig. 2B) than control hybrids (Fig. 5C; see text). **F** *D. nigrofasciatus* × *nacre*^{w2}/*mitf* mutant *D. rerio* do not exhibit pigment patterns significantly different from control hybrids (Figs. 5D, 7).

D. albolineatus candidate genes

Hybrids between mutant D. rerio and D. albolineatus typically developed stripes similar to control hybrids between wild-type D. rerio and D. albolineatus (Fig. 6C, D; compare to Fig. 5B). In contrast, hybrids between fmsi4e1 D. rerio and D. albolineatus lacked stripes and resembled D. albolineatus more closely than the control hybrids (Fig. 6A). These findings raise the possibility that *fms*, which encodes a type III receptor tyrosine kinase expressed by pigment cell precursors (Parichy et al. 2000b), may differ in its activity between D. albolineatus and wild-type D. rerio, identifying fms, or the pathway in which it acts, as a candidate for contributing to the evolutionary loss of stripes in D. albolineatus. To further assess this possibility, we tested two additional alleles, fms^{j4e3} and fms^{j4blue}. Whereas hybrids between fms^{j4e3} (like fms^{j4e1}) D. rerio and D. albolineatus lacked stripes, hybrids between fmsi4blue D. rerio and D. albolineatus resembled control hybrids. As all three mutant alleles tested are predicted to exhibit severe loss of function (Parichy et al. 2000b) but fmsj4blue represents a different genetic background, these results suggest that modifier loci may be present that influence whether or not stripes form. Comparison of *fms* open reading frames in D. albolineatus, D. kerri, D. nigrofasciatus, D. dangila, and D. rerio failed to identify gross lesions (e.g. deletions,

premature stop codons, transposable element insertions) in *D. albolineatus*, but did reveal several unique amino acid substitutions not present in other species (phylogenetic reconstructions based on *fms* sequences were concordant with those from rDNA sequences; data not shown). Finally, crosses between *jaguar*^{c5} or *jaguar*^{b230} *D. rerio* and *D albolineatus* also lacked stripes (Fig. 6B), though this phenotype may reflect a dominant effect of these *jaguar* mutations (see below).

D. kerri candidate genes

Hybrids between fms^{j4blue} or kit^{b5} mutant D. rerio and D. kerri exhibited pigment patterns that were not grossly different from control hybrids between wild-type D. rerio and D. kerri. In contrast, hybrids of D. kerri with either jaguar^{c5} or jaguar^{b230} each resulted in a reduction in stripe number as compared to control hybrids (Fig. 6E; compare with Fig. 5C), yielding a pigment pattern resembling that of D. kerri or jaguar D. rerio (Fig. 2B, E). As both of these *jaguar* alleles are semidominant, and exhibit broken stripes when heterozygous in D. rerio, we asked whether the pigment patterns in these hybrids resulted from a dominant effect of the D. rerio jaguar mutation in the hybrid background, or a difference that might be associated with the D. kerri jaguar orthologue. To distinguish between these possibilities, we crossed D. kerri to heterozygous carriers of a recessive deficiency, jaguar^{c7}. Although homozygous jaguar^{c7} D. rerio die prior to development of an adult pigment pattern, transheterozygous jaguar^{c7}/jaguar^{c5} D. rerio are indistinguishable from *jaguar*^{c5} homozygotes. Hybrids resulting from crosses between D. kerri and jaguar^{c7/+} D. rerio did not exhibit fewer stripes as compared to control hybrids. To verify that hybrids carrying the deficiency survived to adult stages, we used PCR to test for the presence of microsatellite marker z4396, which is centromeric to the *jaguar*^{c7} deficiency, and the presence or absence of microsatellite markers z13822 and z7381 (Shimoda et al. 1999; see http://zebrafish.mgh.harvard.edu),



Fig. 7A-C Quantitative analyses of pigment patterns in D. rerio, D. nigrofasciatus, and hybrids between these species. Parental species: Dre, D. rerio, Dni, D. nigrofasciatus. Hybrid offspring: wt, wild-type D. rerio \times D. nigrofasciatus, fms, fms^{j4blue} D. rerio \times *D.* nigrofasciatus, fr, fritz^{j101e1} *D.* rerio × *D.* nigrofasciatus, jag, jaguar^{c5} *D.* rerio × *D.* nigrofasciatus, kel, kit^{b5} ednrb^{b140} leopard^{t1} D. rerio \times D. nigrofasciatus, nac, nacre^{w2} D. rerio \times D. nigrofasciatus. A Mean stripe number is significantly greater in D. rerio as compared to *D. nigrofasciatus* ($F_{1,18}$ =87.48, *P*<0.0001), and the intermediate stripe number in hybrids between wt *D. rerio* and D. nigrofasciatus differs significantly from both parental species (F_{2.26}=50.75, P<0.0001; Tukey-Kramer comparisons, all P<0.05). Among hybrids between mutant D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus, none exhibited a stripe number significantly less than that observed in control hybrids between wt D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus (Tukey-Kramer comparisons, all P>0.05). B Mean primary melanophore number is significantly greater in D. rerio than D. nigrofasciatus ($F_{1,18}$ =99.63, P<0.0001), and hybrids between wt D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus exhibit an intermediate number of primary melanophores not significantly different from D. rerio, but significantly greater than D. nigrofasciatus ($F_{2.26}$ =66.01, P < 0.0001; Tukey-Kramer comparisons, P > 0.05, P < 0.05 respectively). Hybrids between mutant D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus did not have significantly fewer primary melanophores than control hybrids between wt D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus (Tukey-Kramer comparisons, all P>0.05). C Mean secondary melanophore number was significantly greater in D. rerio than D. nigrofasciatus $(F_{1.18}=136.03, P<0.0001)$ and control hybrids exhibited an intermediate number of secondary melanophores that differed significantly from both parental species (F2,26=77.21, P<0.001; Tukey-Kramer comparisons, P < 0.05). Only hybrids between jag^{c5} D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus exhibited secondary melanophore numbers significantly less than control hybrids (Tukey-Kramer comparison, P < 0.05; see text). Bars ± 1 SD

which are contained within the *jaguar*^{c7} deficiency (N. Gosse, S.L. Johnson, unpublished data). All 17 hybrids tested amplified z4396, indicating the presence of a D. rerio jaguar⁺ or jaguar^{c7} chromosome; 7 of these hybrids failed to amplify both z13822 and z7381, indicating that they carried the *jaguar*^{c7} deficiency chromosome. Although 3 of the jaguar^{c7} carriers exhibited moderately broken stripes, none had fewer stripes as compared to siblings carrying the wild-type *jaguar* allele. These analyses tend to exclude *jaguar* from having a major role in promoting the difference in stripe number between wild-type D. rerio and D. kerri, though conceivably other genes in the pathway in which *jaguar* acts could be involved in this interspecific difference. This possibility is also suggested by the close similarity of the *jaguar D. rerio* × *D. kerri* hybrid non-complementation phenotype to D. kerri, as well as the jaguar D. rerio \times D. albolineatus non-complementation phenotype to D. albolineatus, as compared to the broken stripe phenotype of heterozygous *jaguar*^{c5} or *jaguar*^{b230} D. rerio.

D. nigrofasciatus candidate genes

Pigment patterns of hybrids between mutant D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus typically did not differ from control hybrids (e.g. Figs. 6F, 7), with the exception of hybrids between jaguar^{c5} D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus, which exhibited fewer melanophore stripes and secondary melanophores than controls (Fig. 7A, C), likely due to a dominant effect of the *jaguar*^{c5} mutation (above). Although the *leopard* locus has been suggested to be responsible for the difference between wild-type D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus (Frankel 1979), hybrids between leopard D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus did not have fewer melanophores or fewer stripes than control hybrids (Fig. 7). Finally, despite the similarity of *ednrb1* and *primrose* mutant D. rerio to D. nigrofasciatus, hybrids carrying either of these mutations did not differ from controls. These analyses tend to exclude these loci from having major effect roles in contributing to the difference between wild-type D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus pigment patterns.

Discussion

Pigment patterns are a tractable system for identifying molecular and cellular mechanisms underlying adult form in vertebrates, and how changes in these mechanisms have resulted in phylogenetic transformations of adult traits. The results of this study are a first step in assessing the genetic bases for pigment pattern diversity in the genus *Danio*. Our data provide insights into phylogenetic relationships among danios, the genetics of pigment pattern differences across *Danio* species, and potential roles for candidate genes in contributing to this phenotypic variation.

The genus *Danio* comprises as many as 45–50 species that exhibit considerable variation in pigment pattern,

vertebral count, body size, and other characters (Goodrich et al. 1954; Meyer et al. 1995; Fang 1997a, b, 1998; McClure 1999). Small- and large-bodied danios were traditionally grouped in different genera (Brachydanio and Danio, respectively), and phylogenetic reconstructions based on mitochondrial and nuclear genes have revealed separate clades of large and small species (Meyer et al. 1995; Zardoya et al. 1996). Our analyses were not intended to definitively resolve the phylogenetic relationships within this speciose genus, but rather to elucidate relationships among taxa we used for examining hybrid pigment patterns. Nevertheless, our taxonomically limited analyses support the grouping of large and small danios within a single genus: the large bodied D. dangila is predicted to be more closely related to small danios (e.g. D. rerio) than other large danios (e.g. D. pathirana), based on both mitochondrial rDNA sequences and viability of hybrids. More recent analyses also have placed a small-bodied danio within a clade of otherwise large-bodied species (D.M. Parichy, unpublished data). Thus, the traditional genus Danio is likely to be paraphyletic relative to *Brachydanio*, supporting the view that all of these species should be considered provisionally within Danio. We caution, however, that inclusion of additional species into phylogenetic analyses could conceivably alter these reconstructed relationships, highlighting the need for a thorough molecular and morphological revision of the genus (e.g. Fang 1998). Finally, our analysis of rDNA and fms sequences, as well as patterns of hybrid viability and fertility, identified D. nigrofasciatus as a sister species to D. rerio among the taxa we examined. As both D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus exhibit particularly narrow and well-defined melanophore stripes, this result parsimoniously suggests a qualitative change in stripe-forming mechanisms within this lineage as compared to other danios. Additional developmental and phylogenetic analyses will be required to determine if an ancestor of the clade including D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus possibly exhibited a pigment pattern resembling one or the other of these species, or an intermediate pattern.

The mechanisms underlying pigment pattern diversification in Danio are unknown. Nevertheless, our analyses of interspecific hybrids provide a first insight into the genetic bases of species differences in this genus. Hybrids between D. rerio and either D. dangila, D. albo*lineatus*, or *D. kerri* exhibited pigment patterns that were similar to D. rerio, indicating that alleles of pigment pattern genes in these other species are recessive to D. rerio alleles. Since allelic dominance and recessivity often reflects underlying levels of gene activity (e.g. Kacser and Burns 1981; Besmer et al. 1993), the present results are consistent with a model in which the D. rerio pigment pattern results principally from gain-of-function alleles relative to these other species, or pigment patterns of other species result from loss-of-function alleles relative to D. rerio. The development of stripes in hybrids between D. albolineatus (which lacks stripes) and both D. nigrofasciatus and D. kerri (which exhibit stripes), further supports a model in which the loss of a striped pigment pattern in *D. albolineatus* has resulted from the evolution of loss-of-function alleles in this species relative to striped danios.

In contrast to other species, hybrids between D. rerio and D. nigrofasciatus exhibited pigment patterns that were largely intermediate between the two parental species. Whereas numbers of melanophores in primary melanophore stripes of hybrids were not significantly different from D. rerio, numbers of melanophores in secondary melanophore stripes, and total stripe numbers, were intermediate between species and more similar to D. nigrofasciatus. These findings suggest the existence of different genes contributing to the development of primary stripe melanophores as compared to secondary stripe melanophores and total stripe number, or a common set of loci having antagonistic, pleiotropic effects on these characters. These analyses also are consistent with a model in which greater numbers of primary stripe melanophores in D. rerio result from gain-of-function alleles in this species relative to D. nigrofasciatus (or loss-of-function alleles in D. nigrofasciatus relative to D. rerio).

Our finding that alleles of pigment pattern genes in other species often are recessive to D. rerio alleles allowed us to use interspecific complementation tests to ask whether the same genes affected in D. rerio pigment pattern mutants also might contribute to pigment pattern differences across species. Complementation phenotypes exhibited by most hybrids between D. rerio pigment pattern mutants and other danios suggest that most of the loci tested are not likely to have major effect roles in determining pigment pattern differences across species. For example, *leopard* was an a priori candidate for contributing to the uniform pigment pattern in D. albolineatus (e.g. Haffter et al. 1996; Asai et al. 1999), and has been suggested to be the locus responsible for the pigment pattern differences between D. nigrofasciatus and D. rerio (Frankel 1979). Nevertheless, hybrids between leopard D. rerio and either of these species did not differ discernibly from control hybrids with wild-type D. rerio, suggesting that *leopard* probably is not causally related to the pigment pattern differences between these species and D. rerio. Nevertheless, we do not rule out the possibility that loci tested here might have minor effect roles in contributing to interspecific pigment pattern differences. Finally, phenotypes of interspecific hybrids identified one locus as a potential contributor to a pigment pattern difference between species: hybrids between fms mutant D. rerio and D. albolineatus failed to develop stripes, though this effect depended on the *fms* allele or genetic background tested. The finding of unique amino acid substitutions in D. albolineatus fms is consistent with a difference in the activity of this locus, though functional consequences for these substitutions await experimental evaluation. Further molecular, genetic, and cellular analyses are now underway to test roles for *fms* and *fms*-dependent cell populations during stripe loss in D. albolineatus.

Acknowledgements Thanks to J. Sheppard and J. Manuel for assistance with fish care, and S.R. Voss and D. Cannatella for helpful discussions. Supported by NSF-Sloan Postdoctoral Fellowship DBI-9750006 to D.M.P and NIH R01–56988 to S.L.J.

References

- Asai R, Taguchi E, Kume Y, Saito M, Kondo S (1999) Zebrafish Leopard gene as a component of the putative reaction-diffusion system. Mech Dev 89:87–92
- Bagnara JT (1998) Comparative anatomy and physiology of pigment cells in nonmammalian tissues. In: Nordland JJ, Boissy RE, Hearing VJ, King RA, Ortonne JP (eds) The pigmentary system: physiology and pathophysiology. Oxford University Press, New York, pp 9–40
- Besmer P, Manova K, Duttlinger R, Huang EJ, Packer A, Gyssler C, Bachvarova RF (1993) The *kit*-ligand (steel factor) and its receptor *c-kit/W*: pleiotropic roles in gametogenesis and melanogenesis. Development 1993 Suppl:125–137
- Endler JA (1978) A predator's view of animal color patterns. Evol Biol 11:319–364
- Fang F (1997a) Danio maetaengensis, a new species of cyprinid fish from northern Thailand. Ichthyol Explor Freshw 8:41–48
- Fang F (1997b) Redescription of *Danio kakhienensis*, a poorly known cyprinid fish from the Irrawaddy basin. Ichthyol Explor Freshw 7:289–298
- Fang F (1998) *Danio kyathit*, a new species of cyprinid fish from Myitkyina, northern Myanmar. Ichthyol Explor Freshw 8: 273–280
- Fisher S, Amacher SL, Halpern ME (1997) Loss of *cerebum* function ventralizes the zebrafish embryo. Development 124:1301–1311
- Frankel JS (1979) Inheritance of spotting in the leopard danio. J Hered 70:287–288
- Fujii R (1993) Cytophysiology of fish chromatophores. Int Rev Cytol 143:191–255
- Goodrich HB, Marzullo CM, Bronson WR (1954) An analysis of the formation of color patterns in two fresh-water fish. J Exp Zool 125:487–505
- Haffter P, Odenthal J, Mullins MC, Lin S, Farrell MJ, Vogelsang E, Haas F, Brand M, van Eeden FJM, Furutani-Seiki M, Granato M, Hammerschmidt M, Heisenberg C-P, Jiang Y-J, Kane DA, Kelsh RN, Hopkins N, Nüsslein-Volhard C (1996) Mutations affecting pigmentation and shape of the adult zebrafish. Dev Genes Evol 206:260–276
- Houde AE (1997) Sex, color, and mate choice in guppies. Princeton University Press, Princeton, N.J.
- Johnson SL, Africa D, Walker C, Weston JA (1995) Genetic control of adult pigment stripe development in zebrafish. Dev Biol 167:27–33
- Johnson SL, Gates MA, Johnson M, Talbot WS, Horne S, Baik K, Rude S, Wong JR, Postlethwait JH (1996) Centromere-linkage analysis and consolidation of the zebrafish genetic map. Genetics 142:1277-1288
- Kacser H, Burns JA (1981) The molecular bases of dominance. Genetics 97:639–666
- Kirschbaum F (1975) Untersuchungen über das Farbmuster der Zebrabarbe Brachydanio rerio (Cyprinidae, Teleostei). Wilhelm Roux' Arch Entwicklungsmech Org 177:129–152
- Kocher TD, Thomas WK, Meyer A, Edwards SV, Paabo S, Villablance FX, Wilson AC (1989) Dynamics of mitochondrial DNA evolution in animals. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 86: 6196–6200
- Lister JA, Robertson CP, Lepage T, Johnson SL, Raible DW (1999) *nacre* encodes a zebrafish microphthalmia-related protein that regulates neural crest-derived pigment cell fate. Development 126:3757–3767

- Long AD, Mullaney SL, Mackay TFC, Langley CH (1996) Genetic interactions between naturally occurring alleles at quantitative trait loci and mutant alleles at candidate loci affecting bristle number in *Drosophila melanogaster*. Genetics 144: 1497–1510
- McClure M (1999) Development and evolution of melanophore patterns in fishes of the genus *Danio* (Teleostei: Cyprinidae). J Morphol 241:83–105
- Meyer Á, Ritchie PA, Witte K-E (1995) Predicting developmental processes from evolutionary patterns: a molecular phylogeny of the zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) and its relatives. Philos Trans R Soc Lond Ser B 349:103–111
- Milos N, Dingle AD (1978) Dynamics of pigment pattern formation in the zebrafish, *Brachydanio rerio*. I. Establishment and regulation of the lateral line melanophore stripe during the first eight days of development. J Exp Zool 205: 205–216
- Nechiporuk A, Finney JE, Keating MT, Johnson SL (1999) Assessment of polymorphism in zebrafish mapping strains. Genome Res 9:1231–1238
- Palumbi SR, Martin A, Romano S, McMillan WO, Stice L, Grabowski G (1991) The simple fool's guide to PCR. University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu, Hawaii
- Parichy DM (1996) Salamander pigment patterns: how can they be used to study developmental mechanisms and their evolutionary transformation? Int J Dev Biol 40:871–884
- Parichy DM, Rawls JF, Pratt SJ, Whitfield TT, Johnson SL (1999) Zebrafish *sparse* corresponds to an orthologue of c-*kit* and is required for the morphogenesis of a subpopulation of melanocytes, but is not essential for hematopoiesis or primordial germ cell development. Development 126:3425–3436
- Parichy DM, Kelsh RN, Rawls JF, Mellgren E, Johnson SL (2000a) Mutational analysis of *endothelin receptor b1* (*rose*) during neural crest and pigment pattern development in the zebrafish *Danio rerio*. Dev Biol 227:294–306
- Parichy DM, Ransom DG, Paw B, Zon L, Johnson SL (2000b) An orthologue of the *kit*-related gene *fms* is required for development of neural crest-derived xanthophores and a subpopulation of adult melanocytes in the zebrafish, *Danio rerio*. Development 127:3031–3044
- Rawls JF, Johnson SL (2000) Zebrafish *kit* mutation reveals primary and secondary regulation of melanocyte development during fin stripe regeneration. Development 127:3715–3724
- Reedy MV, Parichy DM, Erickson CA, Mason KA, Frost-Mason SK (1998) The regulation of melanoblast migration and differentiation. In: Nordland JJ, Boissy RE, Hearing VJ, King RA, Ortonne JP (eds) The pigmentary system: physiology and pathophysiology. Oxford University Press, New York, pp 75–95
- Shimoda N, Knapik EW, Ziniti J, Sim C, Yamada E, Kaplan S, Jackson D, Sauvage F de, Jacob H, Fishman MC (1999) Zebrafish genetic map with 2000 microsatellite markers. Genomics 58:219–232
- Streisinger G, Walker C, Dower N, Knauber D, Singer F (1981) Production of clones of homozygous diploid zebra fish (*Brachydanio rerio*). Nature 291:293–296
- Sucena E, Stern DL (2000) Divergence of larval morphology between *Drosophila sechillia* and its sibling species caused by *cis*-regulatory evolution of *ovo/shaven-baby*. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 97:4530–4535
- Swofford DL (2000) PAUP*. Phylogenetic analysis using parsimony (*and other methods), version 4. Sinauer, Sunderland, Mass.
- Westerfield M (1993) The zebrafish book. University of Oregon, Eugene, Ore.
- Zardoya R, Abouheif E, Meyer A (1996) Evolutionary analyses of hedgehog and *Hoxd-10* genes in fish species closely related to the zebrafish. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 93:13036–13041